Progress and Challenges for Music Generation By Deep Neural Networks (Deep Learning)

Jean-Pierre Briot

Jean-Pierre.Briot@lip6.fr

LIP6 Sorbonne Université – CNRS



Programa de Pós-Graduação em Informática (PPGI)

UNIRIO



Jean-Pierre Briot

Deep Learning – Music Generation – 2019

- Music Generation
- Recent boom using Deep Learning Techniques
- Very active domain
 - Ex: Google Magenta Project
- What is New?
 - From Initial Neural Networks
- Generative Architectures
 - Variational Autoencoders (VAE)
 - Generative Adversarial Networks (GAN)
- Issues
 - Interaction, Control, Creativity, Structure
- Prospects

- Deep Learning Music Generation Recent Achievements
- Neural Networks
- A First Example of Music Generation
- Pioneering Work of Neural Network-based Music Generation (1988)
- From Neural Networks to Deep Learning
- Deep Learning Progress and Architectures
- Variational Autoencoders (VAE)
- Generative Adversarial Networks (GAN)
- Autonomous Generation vs Creation Support
- Issues/Challenges
- Control
- Conclusion

Recent Creations

Doodle Bach Chorales



https://www.google.com/doodles/celebrating-johann-sebastian-bach

- YACHT (Young Americans Challenging High Technology)
- Chain Tripping Album, 30 August 2019
- Composed with Magenta MusicVAE [Roberts et al., 2018]





ateto a cho la ateto a cho

l'm so in love I can feel it in my car I can feel it in my heart, I can feel it so hard I want your phone to my brain I want you to call my name I want you to call my name I want you to do it too Oh, won't you come, won't you come Won't you work on my head Be my number nine





Loud Light

(Downtown) Dancing

Jean-Pierre Briot

Deep Learning – Music Generation – 2019

Y∆CHT + Magenta – Chain Tripping Album

- Melody/Chords/Rhythm Loops
 - MusicVAE (VRAE)
 - Training Corpus: Previous music by Y∆CHT
- Lyrics
 - LSTM
 - Training Corpus: Y∆CHT + Liked Lyrics
- Sounds
 - Nsynth (Signal VAE)
- Images and Videos
 - GAN







https://arstechnica.com/gaming/2019/08/yachts-chain-tripping-is-a-new-landmark-for-aimusic-an-album-that-doesnt-suck/

Jean-Pierre Briot

Deep Learning – Music Generation – 2019

YACHT + Magenta – Chain Tripping Album

• Rules:

Jean-Pierre Briot

- Every new song interpolated from existing Y∆CHT melodies
- 4 measures-long loops
- Cannot add any note, harmony
- Only substractive or transpositional changes I can Feel i
- Structure and collage allowed
- Assignment (to vocal, bass line...)
- Human Production and Arrangements

https://www.youtube.com/watch?time_continue=1378&v=pM9u9xcM_cs&feature=emb_logo





Painting

- 26 October 2018, Christie's Auction, New York, US\$ 432 500
- Edmond de Belamy, Obvious (Collective)
- Created with Deep Learning (GAN)
- Trained with 15 000 paintings (XIV XX centuries)



Hello World

- January 2018, Hello World
- Created by Musicians (Musical Direction: Skygge aka Benoît Carré)
- with FlowComposer [Pachet et al., 2014]
- ERC Project Flow Machines [Pachet et al., 2012-2017]





• Various Techniques (Markov Constraints, Rules, ...)



Hello World

- January 2018, Hello World, Flow Records
- Making Off



https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=yxTF-UFvoHU

"Beyond the Fence" Musical

- PropperWryter
- The Cloul Lyricist
- Folk-RNN
- Flow Machines



• Arts Theater, London, February-March 2016





https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=lzeSDlol-7l

https://www.youtube.com/watch?time_continue=75&v=VZzI4sfCFjc

Deep Learning – Music Generation – 2019

Deep Learning

Deep Learning

- Boom Since 2012 (Imagenet Breakthrough)
- Image Recognition
- Weather Prediction
- Translation
- Speech Recognition
- Speech Synthesis
- Source Separation
- Music Creation
- Image Creation













Deep Reinforcement Learning [Silver et al., 2013]

internal state

- Deep Learning improves Other Machine Learning Paradigm Implementation:
 - Reinforcement Learning

- Deep Reinforcement Learning
 - Efficient Estimation of Gain (Q-Learning Q-Table)
 - Massive Simulation/Evaluation (Massive Processing)
 - Replay Mechanism (Massive Memory)
- First Application: Atari Games

- Second Application: Go
 - Alpha Go, AlphaZero Go



reward

Speech/Music Separation

- Long Time Very Hard Problem, Now Resolved
- Cocktail Effect Voice Separation



Music/Voice Separation



Mitsubishi Electric Research Labs (MERL)

Publicado em 1 de ago de 2016

From Neural Networks to Deep Learning

Deep Learning

- Overwhelming Success
- Simple Basic Receipt
 - Linear/Logistic Regression
 - Loss Function Minimization



- Technical Improvements (since First Neural Networks)
 - Backpropagation, LSTM, Batch Normalization...
 - Loss Function Wide Application
 - » Meta-Level, ex: LSTM
 - » Constraints, ex: VAE
 - Optimized Implementations/Platforms
- Scale+
 - CPU

– Data Jean-Pierre Briot





Neural Networks in One Slide

Principle – Error Prediction/Classification Feedback hidden layer 1 hidden layer 2 hidden layer 3 input layer **If Error Adjust Connexion Weights Training Examples Prediction or Classification** output layer Х

Neural Networks in One Two Slides

Principle – Error Prediction/Classification Feedback hidden layer 1 hidden layer 2 hidden layer 3 input layer If Error Adjust Connexion Weights **Training Examples Prediction or** Classification output layer Х Weights Non Linear θ, **Activation Function** θ_2 sigmoid θ_3 Weighted Sum sigmoid($\theta_0 + \theta_1 x_1 + \theta_2 x_2 + ...$) Deep Learning – Music Generation – 2019 20 Jean-Pierre Briot Bias

- Neural Network =
- Successive Layers of Logistic Regression =
- Successive Layers of Linear Regression + Non Linear Activation Function



- Neural Network =
- Successive Layers of Logistic Regression =
- Successive Layers of Linear Regression + Non Linear Activation Function



Example (TensorFlow PlayGround)



Nice Animation [3Blue1Brown]



https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=aircAruvnKk

A First Example of Music Generation

Artistic Content Generation Basic Cycle

Curation

- Collecting Examples (Training Set)
- Extensional Definition of the Style
- Configuration
 - of the (Selected) Learning Model/Architecture
- Selection
 - Among Results Generated



Neural Network Direct Application

Feedorward Architecture ott lässt wal den lie_ ten und hof_fet auf ihn al _ le denwirder wunder bar er hal ten in al. Iem Kreuz und Traurig Classification Task (What Notes) **Counterpoint (Chorale) Generation** Training on the Set of (389) J. S. Bach Chorales (Choral Gesang) Alto Õ О Ο Õ 111111111111111111 \cap But for her relificient for the for the Tenor Soprano Ο hidden layer input layer 200 nodes Ο 1344 nodes Ο Ο 2011 - I - I - I - I - I - I - I - I Ο Bass Input: 1 Melody **Output: 3 Melodies** output layer 4480 nodes Deep Learning – Music Generation – 2019 Jean-Pierre Briot

Representation



Jean-Pierre Briot

Deep Learning – Music Generation – 2019

Representation



Music / Representation / Network



ForwardBach



ForwardBach



ForwardBach Brazilian Hymn Counterpoint



Jean-Pierre Briot

Deep Learning – Music Generation – 2019

Bach Chorales

- December 2016, DeepBach, Gaëtan Hadjeres
- Deep Learning
- Training Set = 352 Chorales



https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=QiBM7-5hA6o

Reorchestration of God Save the Queen by DeepBach [Hadjeres, 2017]

History of Neural Network-based Music Generation
Number of Scientific Papers about Neural Networks and Music (Generation, Classification...) [Pons, 2018]



#Citations



» Computer Science » Artificial Intelligence

Computational Synthesis and Creative Systems



Deep Learning Techniques for Music Generation © 2019

Deep Learning Techniques for Music Generation

Authors: Briot, Jean-Pierre, Hadjeres, Gaëtan, Pachet, François-David

2 Springer

Neural Networks Evolution







The Old Emperor Old Clothes (Neural Networks)

- Single Hidden Layer Neural Network
- Hand Made
- Technical Limitations
- Slow CPU
- Small memory
- Few Examples



First Experiments in Using Artificial Neural Networks for Music Generation

1988–1989

- Lewis, J. P., Creation by Refinement: A Creativity Paradigm for Gradient Descent Learning Networks, International Conference on Neural Networks, San Diego, CA, USA, July 1988, pp. II-229–233.
- Todd, Peter M., A Sequential Network Design for Musical Applications, Proceedings of the 1988 Connectionist Models Summer School, CMU, June 1988, Touretsky, D., Hinton, G., Sejnowski, T. (eds), Morgan Kaufmann, pp. 76–84, 1989.
- Todd, Peter M., A Connectionist Approach to Algorithmic Composition, Computer Music Journal (CMJ), MIT Press, 13(4):27–43, 1989.

2004

 Mozer, M. C., Neural Network Music Composition by Prediction: Exploring the Benefits of Psychoacoustic Constraints and Multi-scale Processing, Connection Science, 6(2&3):247–280, 1994

Todd's Architecture Variation [Todd, 1989]



Todd's Conditioned Generation



Todd's Architecture Prospects/Addendum (1/2) [Todd, 1989]

- Structure
- One of the largest problems with this sequential network approach is the limited length of sequences that can be learned and the corresponding lack of global structure that new compositions exhibit. Hierarchically organized and connected sets of sequential networks hold promise for addressing these difficulties. Several ways of passing control back and forth between the interconnected networks will be described and the remaining issue of learning hierarchical structures will be addressed in this addendum.

• Hierarchy

One solution to these problems is first to take the sequence to be learned and divide it up into appropriate chunks [for instance, in the case of the sequence just presented, these could be A-B-C-D, E-E-E, A-B-C-D, and G-G]. Next, train a sequential network to produce each of these subsequence chunks with a different plan. Finally, give this network the appropriate sequence of subsequence plans so that it will produce the chunks in the proper order to recreate the entire original pattern.

Multiple Time/Clocks

Of course, one way to present this subsequencegenerating network with the appropriate sequence of plans is to generate *those* by another sequential network, operating at a slower time scale. Then,



- Precursor of
- Hierarchy
 - Ex: MusicVAE [Roberts et al., 2018]

- Multiple Time/Clocks
 - Ex: Clockwork RNN [Koutnik et al., 2014]

- SampleRNN [Mehri et al., 2017]



Lewis' Creation by Refinement (1/4) [Lewis, 1988]

- Training on 30 Manually Generated 5-Note Melodies
- 7 Possible Notes (from C to B, without alteration)
- Well Formed
 - Possible Intervals:
 - » Unison, 3rd, 5th,
 - » Scale Degree Stepwise Motion
- Poorly Formed
 - Excessive Motion or Excessive Repetition
- Binary Classification Training
 - Well or Poorly Formed





Ex. of Training Examples







Under the Control of a Gradient Descent on Error in Predicted Well Formed Jean-Pierre Briot Deep Learning – Music Generation – 2019

Lewis' Creation by Refinement (3/6)





Ex. of Melodies Created by Refinement

• The Network Learned Preference for Stepwise and Triadic Motion

Jean-Pierre Briot

Lewis' Creation by Refinement (5/6)

Attention

Attentional CBR

In order to partition a large problem into manageable subproblems, we need to provide both an attention mechanism to select subproblems to present to the network and a context mechanism to tie the resulting subpatterns together into a coherent whole. A context mechanism can be provided by context inputs, which during the creation phase are clamped to the values of the surrounding and previously constructed pattern. As an example, to produce elaborations on a short phrase, the training set inputs would consist of sample phrases paired with corresponding embellished phrases (possibly using a suitable null-note representation to allow different phrase lengths), and the critique would (as usual) consist of some critique of the character of the embellishment. In the creation phase, the embellished inputs would be set to random values, but the context inputs would be clamped to the phrase itself.

Hierarchy

The author's experiments have employed hierarchical CBR. In this approach, a developing pattern is recursively filled in using a scheme somewhat analogous to a formal grammar rule such as $ABC \rightarrow$ AxByC, which expands the string without modifying existing tokens. That is, three tokens (for example, musical notes) labeled A, B, C will be expanded with two additional tokens x, y inserted in the indicated positions. The expanded string AxByC may be rewritten further using a suitable scheme.



Ex. of Melodies Created by Hierarchical Refinement (ABCD -> ABxCD scheme)

Jean-Pierre Briot

Reinforcement

Reinforcement CBR

Developing the training set is probably the most difficult aspect of employing CBR (and other supervised learning algorithms). In reinforcement CBR some or all of the training set is produced automatically, by completing the domain, rather than being compiled by the experimenter as in the standard supervised learning paradigm. In this scheme, the training phase is interrupted at intervals, and the creation phase is invoked. The resulting creations are evaluated by the experimenter and are added to the training set with a corresponding critique if they are judged to extend the existing training set. After the training set is extended, the net is retrained, followed by the accumulation of new examples, etc., until all sample creations are judged satisfactory by both the experimenter and the network.

Not Reinforcement learning

Created Melodies which are Liked are Added to the Training Set

- Precursor of
- Gradient Descent Input Manipulation [Briot et al., 2017]
- Ex: DeepHear [Sun, 2016]
 - Melody Consonant Accompaniment Creation



Lewis' Creation by Refinement Pioneering (2/3)

- Precursor of
- Gradient Ascent Input Manipulation [Briot et al., 2017]
- Ex: DeepDream [Mordvintsev et al. 2015]
 - Motif Detector Neuron Activation Maximization



Lewis' Creation by Refinement Pioneering (3/3)

Initial Image

Deep Dream Image



Structure Imposition (1/2) [Lattner et al., 2016]

- Constrained sampling, C-RBM [Lattner et al., 2016]
- Convolutional Restricted Boltzmann Machine (RBM)
- Combination of:
 - Input Manipulation guided by Gradient Descent of current sample visible laver
 - » to impose Higher-Level Structure/Constraints:
 - Structure (Structure Repetition, Ex: AABA), via Self-Similarity Matrix
 - Tonality, via Similarity of Distribution of Pitch-Classes
 - Meter (Rhythm Pattern/Signature and Beat Accent)
 - Sampling Control, by Selective Gibbs sampling (SGS)
 - » at a Selected Low-Level (subset of variables)
 - » to realign selectively the sample to the learnt distribution
 - Alternate IP/GD and SGS, controlled by Simulated Annealing
 - But not exact as, e.g., Markov Constraints [Pachet & Roy, 2011]

Deep Learning – Music Generation – 2019

Relative onset frequencies on har position

Structure Imposition



- Self-Similarity Matrix »
- For each Music Slice »



Meter

》

- Duration and Accent Patterns (ex: on 1st and 3rd Beats) **》**
- Via Relative Occurrence of Note Onsets »

Key Estimation Vectors over Time

Jean-Pierre Briot

C-RBM [Lattner et al., 2016]



Both Manipulation and Sampling of Input because RBM's "Output" is its Input

https://soundcloud.com/pmgrbm

Jean-Pierre Briot

C-RBM Examples

RNN-RBM Sample

• Unconstrained Sample

• Template Piece





))

()))

https://soundcloud.com/pmgrbm

Mozer's Rich Representation Model [Mozer, 1994]





Pitch	РН			(cc					i	CF		
 C1	-9.978	+1	+1	+1	-1	-1	-1	-1	-1	-1	+1	+1	+1
FII	-7.349	-1	-1	-1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	-1	-1	-1
G2	-2.041	-1	-1	1	-1	+1	+1	-1	-1	-1	-1	+1	+1
C3	0	+1	+1	+1	-1	-1	-1	-1	-1	-1	+1	+1	+1
DB	1.225	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1
E3	1.633	-1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	-1	-1	-1	-1	-1
A4	8.573	-1	-1	-1	-1	-1	-1	-1	-1	-1	-1	-1	-1
C5	9.798	+1	+1	+1	-1	-1	-1	-1	-1	-1	+1	+1	+1
Rest	0	+1	-1	+1	-1	+1	-1	+1	-1	+1	-1	+1	-1

[Mozer, 2004]



From Neural Networks to Deep Learning

Neural Networks Evolution



History: From Perceptron to Artificial Neural Networks to Deep Learning (1/4)



Linear vs Non Linear Decision Boundary



- Argument (XOR) used by [Minsky & Papert 1969] to criticize Perceptrons [Rosenblatt 1957] (and advocate Symbolic Artificial Intelligence)
- This stopped research on Perceptrons/Neural Networks for a long while

until Hidden Layers and Backpropagation or/and Kernel Trick (see later)
Jean-Pierre Briot
Deep Learning – Music Generation – 2019

History: From Perceptron to Artificial Neural Networks to Deep Learning (2/4)

 \mathbf{O}

Maximum. margin



Difficulty to Efficiently Train Networks with many Layers SVM [Vapnik 1963] SVM + Kernel Trick [Vapnik et al. 1992]

Unstable Gradients

Nice Model and Optimized Implementation

Margin Optimization



Pre-Training [Hinton et al. 2006] Layer-Wise Self-Supervised Training/Initialization

Rank	Name	Error rate	Description			
1	U. Toronto	0.15315	Deep learning			
2	U. Tokyo	0.26172	Hand-crafted			
3	U. Oxford	0.26979	features and			
4	Xerox/INRIA	0.27058	Bottleneck.			

ImageNet 2012 Image Recognition Challenge Breakthrough



Jean-Pierre Briot

History: From Perceptron to Artificial Neural Networks to Deep Learning (3/4)



History: From Perceptron to Artificial Neural Networks to Deep Learning (4/4)



Power Increase

• Brute Force





Loss Minimization

• Hypervitamined Brute Force



72
Why Deep?

- More Complex Models
- Learns better Complex Functions
- Hierarchical Features/Abstractions
- No Need for Handcrafted Features
 - (Automatically Extracted)

Traditional Pattern Recognition: Fixed/Handcrafted feature extraction



Modern Pattern Recognition: Unsupervised mid-level features



Deep Learning: Train hierarchical representations

Low-level + Mid-level + High-level + Trainable Features + Features + Classifier

Source: Talk Computer Perception with Deep Learning by Yann LeCun

End-to-End Architecture



Deep Learning – Music Generation – 2019



Distributed Representations

Why Deep ?

- Theorem [Eldan & Shamir 2016]
 - There is a simple radial function on R^d, expressible by a 3-layer net, but which cannot be approximated by any 2-layer net to more than a constant accuracy unless its width is exponential on the dimension d
 - − Depth → vs/and Width |





Radial function = Function whose value at each point depends only on distance between point and origin



Very Deep Learning



75

х

identity

relu

The Groundbreaking Start of Deep Learning







Pre-Training [Hinton et al. 2006] Layer-Wise Self-Supervised Training/Initialization

Rank	Name	Error rate	Description
1	U. Toronto	0.15315	Deep learning
2	U. Tokyo	0.26172	Hand-crafted
3	U. Oxford	0.26979	features and learning models. Bottleneck.
4	Xerox/INRIA	0.27058	

ImageNet 2012 Image Recognition Challenge Breakthrough

WaveNet Audio End-to-End Generation [van den Oord et al., 2017]

- Van den Oord, A., Dieleman, S., Zen, H., Simonyan, K., Vinyals, O., Graves, A., Kalchbrenner, N., Senior, A., Kavukcuoglu, K., WaveNet: A Generative Model for Raw Audio, arXiv:1609.03499, December 2016.
- Waveform
- End to end architecture





New Architectures



Artificial Intelligence and Machine Learning

Symbolic vs Connexionist AI – History



Symbolic vs Cybernetics – History



Jean-Pierre Briot

Deep Learning – Music Generation – 2019

81

Artificial Intelligence vs Intelligence Augmentation – History



Jean-Pierre Briot

Deep Learning – Music Generation – 2019

82

Machine Learning and Artificial Intelligence

- Various Forms of Machine Learning
- Statistical
- Neural Networks, Bayesian Networks, Clustering...
- Decision
- Reinforcement learning
- Symbolic Learning Concepts from Examples
- Inductive Logic Programming (ILP)
- Learning and Adapting from Cases
- Case-Based Reasoning

Machine Learning and Artificial Intelligence

- Machine Learning is Part of Artificial Intelligence Techniques But also:
- Reasoning
- Planning
- Knowledge Representation
- User Modeling and Interaction
- Collaboration (Multi-Agent Systems)
- Natural Language Processing
- Dialogue
- Speech Processing
- Decision
- Game Theory
- Optimization
- Robotics
 Jean-Pierre Briot

Deep Learning – Music Generation – 2019

- Backfire (Irony) of History
- In 1960, Minsky and Papert founded AI (Artificial Intelligence) based on Concepts, Symbols, Logic, Reasoning..., Against Cybernetics (Feedback) and Connexionism (Neural Networks)
- In 1969, they "Killed" Connexionism/Neural Networks (Sound Critic of Perceptron)
- In 2006, Start of Deep Learning
- Now, AI is synonym of Deep Learning
- When Actually, Neural Networks are somehow based on Statistical (Correlation) Brute Force

Terminology



Why Using Computer and Machine Learning (for Creating Music)?

Why Using Computer for Music

• Bad Reasons (Fears)

- Lead human musicians to unemployment
- Lower the quality of music ©



Good reasons

- Facilitate storing, indexing, delivering and sharing of music (MIDI, MP3, Spotify...)
- New instruments and interaction (Synthesizers, Interactive music performances...)
- New sounds (Synthesizers and Signal processing)
- Analysis tools and algorithms (Spectrum, Patterns Discovery...)
- Initiation and Education (Band in the Box, Garage Band...)
- Production
 - Partially automate tasks (Ex: Mixing, etc.)
- Composition, Analysis and Arrangement
 - Algorithmic composition
 - Harmonization
 - Analysis



Why Using Computer (and Machine Learning) for Music

Vast Associative Memory

- More systematic than Human memory
- Representation of Musical pieces, Style, Patterns...
- Associations and Correlations
- Knowledge (Theory, Rules, Heuristics...)
- Can Help Human musicians
- Human musicians rarely compose from scratch They borrow from others
 - Consciously
 - » Plagiat, Citation...
 - Unconsciously
 - » Influence
 - Recombinations
 - Historical Evolution/Extension
 - » Modal monophonic -> Polyphonic (Counterpoint) -> Tonal Music (Harmony) -> Extended Harmony (Debussy, Jazz...)
 - Ruptures (Dodecaphonism, Free Jazz, Punk...)
 - » Rare and often transient

Deep Learning – Music Generation – 2019

Some Preconcepts Against Deep Learning / Al

- No Emotion
 - Create Emotion to the Human Target?
 - Or/And Internal Model of Emotion ?
- No Creativity
 - Exploratory
 - » AlphaZero used successful strategies yet unconsidered
 - Recombination
 - » Concept and Conjecture Discovery (ex: Numbers, Prime Numbers, Prime Numbers Decomposition) AM and Eurisko [Lenat, 1976; 1983]

[Bryson et al., 2004]

- » Style Transfer [Gatys et al., 2015]
- Paradigm Reformulation
 - » Ex: Quantum Physics, Algebraic Geometry, Dodecaphonism...
 - » More difficult











Handcrafted vs Learnt Models

- Handcrafted
 - Tedious
 - Error-Prone
- Automatically Learnt (Induction)
 - Markov Models
 - Neural Models
- Style Automatic Learned from a Corpus (Composer, Form, Genre...)
 - Melody
 - Harmony
 - Counterpoint
 - Orchestration
 - Production

- inforcement Learning Provide State Style Flow Machines [Pachet et al. 2012]
- Machine Learning Techniques
 - Neural Networks, Deep Learning, Reinforcement Learning
 - (and other models/techniques, Ex: Markov Models)

Deep Learning Phylogenetics



Jean-Pierre Briot

Deep Learning Phylogenetics



Jean-Pierre Briot

Self-References for More Information

J.-P. Briot, G. Hadjeres, F.-D. Pachet, Deep Learning Techniques for Music Generation, Computational Synthesis and Creative Systems Series, Springer, 2019.

https://www.springer.com/br/book/9783319701622

ArXiv version:

https://arxiv.org/abs/1709.01620

UNIRIO Course:

http://www-desir.lip6.fr/~briot/cours/unirio3/

Slides and programs
0. General Introduction

Slides

1. Introduction to Computer Music

Slides

Slides

2. Introduction to Deep Learning

Slides

MNIST handwritten digit classification <u>Code</u> Version without one hot <u>Code</u> Version with one hidden layer <u>Code</u> Version with convolutions <u>Code</u>

3. Generation by Feedforward Architectures

DeepMusic Representation <u>Code</u> DeepMusic Config <u>Code</u> DeepMusic Metrics <u>Code</u> Deep Music <u>README</u>

DeepMusic Bach chorale counterpoint Feedforward generator Code

Original Bach chorale from training dataset <u>Midi</u> DeepMusic Bach chorale from training dataset counterpoint regenerated <u>Midi</u> Original Bach chorale from test dataset <u>Midi</u> DeepMusic Bach chorale counterpoint from test dataset regenerated <u>Midi</u> Brazilian hymn <u>Midi</u> DeepMusic Brazilian hymn counterpoint generated <u>Midi</u>

4. Generation by Autoencoder Architectures

Slides

MNIST handwritten digit Autoencoder generator Code

DeepMusic Bach chorale melody Autoencoder generator Code

Melody generated - label elements all 0 <u>Midi</u> Melody generated - label elements all 0 <u>Midi</u> Melody generated - label elements random [0, 1] <u>Midi</u>



Computational Synthesis and Creative Systems

🖄 Springer

Deep Learning – Music Generation – 2019

Survey/Analysis



Objective

- Melody
 - Monodic
 - Polyphonic
- Polyphony (Multiple Voices/Tracks)
- Accompaniment
 - Counterpoint
 - » Melody
 - » Melodies (Chorale)
 - Chords





Leadsheet









Representation

- Signal
 - Waveform
 - Spectrum
- Symbolic
 - MIDI
 - Piano roll
 - Text
 - Chord
 - Lead sheet
 - Rhythm



|:eA (3AAA g2 fg|eA (3AAA BGGf|eA (3AAA g2 fg|lafge d2 gf:|2afge d2 cd||
|:eaag efgf|eaag edBd|eaag efge|afge dgfg:|

EbMaj7/G

Madium Swing (in 2) $A = A^{1/N_{A}}$ $B^{T} = B^{N_{A}} = B^{N_{A}}$ $B^{T} = B^{N_{A}} = B^{N_{A}}$

Deep Learning – Music Generation – 2019

Architecture

- Feedforward
- Recurrent (RNN)
 - Long Short-Term Memory (LSTM)
- Autoencoder
 - Stacked Autoencoders
- Restricted Boltzmann Machine (RBM)
- Variational Autoencoder (VAE) •
- Patterns
 - Convolutional
 - Conditioning
 - Generative Adversarial Networks (GAN)
- **Reinforcement Learning**
- **Refinement and Compound**
- Ex: VRAE = Variational(Autoencoder(RNN, KNN) = Variational(RNN Encoder-Decoder) Jean-Pierre Briot

Deep Learning – Music Generation – 2019



flow (time)

Output - ~5000 bits

1024 neuron 256 nouror

nput - ~5000 hits

nodes



Refined and Compound Architectures

- Composition
 - Bidirectional RNN
 - RNN-RBM
- Refinement
 - Variational(Autoencoder) (VAE)
- Nested
 - Stacked Autoencoder
 - RNN Encoder-Decoder = Autoencoder(RNN, RNN)
- Pattern Instantiation
 - C-RBM = Convolutional(RBM)
 - C-RNN-GAN = GAN(RNN, RNN)
- Compound
 - VRASH = Variational(Autoencoder(RNN, Conditioning(RNN, History))).

Challenge

1. Ex Nihilo Generation

» vs Accompaniment (Need for Input)

2. Length Variability

» vs Fixed Length

3. Content Variability

» vs Determinism

4. Control

- » ex: Tonality conformance, Maximum number of repeated notes...
- 5. Structure
- 6. Originality
 - » vs Conformance

7. Incrementality

» vs Single-step or Iterative Generation

8. Interactivity

» vs (Autistic) Automation

9 Explainability

Deep Learning – Music Generation – 2019

(Generation) Strategy

Feedforward Output Output - ~5000 bits 1024 neuron Single-Step Feedforward 256 neuron 64 neurons 16 neurons **Iterative Feedforward** 64 neurons 256 neurons 1024 neurons **Decoder Feedforward** Input - ~5000 bits [Sun, 2016] Conditioning [Yang et al., 2017] Sampling • [Boulanger-Lewandowski et al., 2012] +1 (+1 +1 () **x**₁ (Input Manipulation •• O **y**1 x3 () y₂ X4 (**Adversarial** • [Mogren, 2016] Semantic Relevance Cost Reinforcement Target Q Network lusic Theory Reward p(a | s) r **Unit Selection** والمالية المعال المحالية معارك والمدمين [Bretan et al., 2016] [Jaques et al., 2016] Deep Learning – Music Generation Jean-Pierre Briot - 2019

Generative Architectures

Variational Autoencoder

Autoencoder

- Symmetric Neural Network
- Trained with examples as input and output
- Hidden Layer will Learn a Compressed Representation at the Hidden Layer (Latent Variables)



Variational Autoencoder (VAE) [Kingman & Welling, 2014]

- Additional Constraint:
- Encoded representation (latent variables z) follows some prior probability distribution p(z), usually, a Gaussian distribution (normal law)



- The VAE decoder part will learn the relation between a Gaussian distribution of the latent variables and the learnt examples
- A VAE is able to learn a *smooth* latent space *mapping* to realistic examples

Representation/Manifold Learning



Deep Learning – Music Generation – 2019

VAE MNIST [Keras/Cholet, 2016]



Variational Autoencoder



[Dykeman, 2016]

Deep Learning – Music Generation – 2019
Generation by Exploring the Latent Space and Decoding



[[]Dykeman, 2016]

VAE MNIST [Keras/Cholet, 2016]



Z₂

VAE Magic



VAE Magic Revealed



VAE Magic Revealed



Split/Extract between

- Common Data: Weights
- Variable/Discriminative Data: • Latent Variables

Hidden Layer Latent Variables **Output Layer**

Variational Generation

Exploration of the latent space with various operations to control/vary the generation of content

Ex:

- Translation
- Arbitrary path
- Interpolation (morphing) (between points)
- Averaging (of some points)
- Attribute arithmetic
 - Addition or subtraction of an attribute vector capturing a given characteristic
 - This attribute vector is computed as the average latent vector for a collection of examples sharing that attribute (characteristic)

Attribute Arithmetic

- (Characteristics) Attribute Arithmetic
 - Addition or subtraction of an attribute vector capturing a given characteristic
 - This attribute vector is computed as the average latent vector for a collection of examples sharing that attribute (characteristic)
- Select a set of round and angular digits images
 - round_numbers = [3, 6, 8, 9]
 - angular_numbers = [1, 4, 7]
- Encode each one
 - _, _, z_round_elements = encoder.predict(np.array(round_elements))
 - _, _, z_angular_elements = encoder.predict(np.array(angular_elements))
- Compute the mean of the (z) corresponding latent variable values
 - z1_mean_round_elements = mean(z1_round_elements)
 - z1_mean_angular_elements = mean(z1_angular_elements)
 - ...
- Do attribute arithmetic
 - def roundify(z):
 - z_rounded = [z[0] + z1_mean_round_elements, z[1] + z2_mean_round_elements]
 - return(decoder.predict(np.array([z_rounded]))[0])

Jean-Pierre Briot

Examples



Variational Autoencoder Ex. of Attribute Arithmetic



Jean-Pierre Briot

Bach Choral Soprano Melodies Z₁ Step Interpolation



Bach Choral Soprano Melodies Z₂ Step Interpolation





Celtic Music

- Training Examples/Corpus:
- In ABC format (see later) -> Music21 -> representation
- 29 songs from the Session (<u>https://thesession.org/</u>)
- In the same key (D major) and the same rhythm metric (4/4)

nesession.org	MUNDO	DECODDING	TRIDO	05001030	DUDNO	©
Log in or Sign up	TUNES	RECORDINGS	TRIPS	SESSIONS	EVENTS	DISCUSSIONS
тне						
Session						
	Fáilte					
	Search Tune	es 🗧 for				SEARCH
	The Session is a community website dedicated to Irish traditional music.					
	You can find tu	nes to play, find sessions to play	them in, and join in disc	ussions about the music. Y	ou can also find events (li	ike concerts and festivals), or
	explore the tra	ck listings of recordings.				
	You can contril	bute too. If you're already a mem	ber, you can <mark>log in</mark> . If you	're not yet a member, men	nbership is free and it onl	y takes a moment to sign up.
	» Recent Activity	<i></i>				
	Support T	he Session				
	m on in i	6. J. V. J.				
	The Session is	a non-pront endeavour. Your do	nations help to keep the s	ite up and running.		
	1. Set up a recurr	ng donation of				
	····					
	0r					
	2. Make one-time	donation DONATE				
	Elsewhere					
	🎽 Follow @sessio	onupdates on Twitter.				
	f Like The Sessio	on on Facebook.				
	 Subscribe to Ti Join The Session 	ne Session channel on YouTube.				
	tom me book	singroup on Theat				
	T	Au				Filler
				A CARLE		
		P (3)				
	- 63		104.8	A AND A		

Celtic Melodies Z₁ Step Interpolation





Disentanglement (1/3)



Disentanglement (2/3)

• Adding Term to the Reconstruction Loss [IBM Research, 2018]



• Deconstructing the β -VAE [Mathieu et al., 2019]



• Reconstruction Trade-off via Jacobian Supervision [Lezama, 2019]



Jean-Pierre Briot

- Dual Branch Adversarial (DualDIS) [Robert el al, 2019]
- Separate Dimensions in Distinct Autoencoders (E_y and E_z)
- Measure the Presence/Absence of the Dual Dimension through a Dual (Adversarial) Classifier (C_z and C_y)
- Objective(s): Not Being Able to Classify Properly the Dual Dimension



Implicit vs Explicit Dimensions (Disentanglement)

- Dimensions (ex: Pitch Range, Duration Range...) are « Chosen » by the Architecture
- But we can also Configure/Train the Architecture in order to « Force » some Dimensions



Ex: EC2-VAE [Yang et al., 2019]



Examples EC2-VAE [Yang et al., 2019]



Examples EC2-VAE [Yang et al., 2019]



Rythm Reference C



Rest(B) + Rythm(C)



Jean-Pierre Briot

MusicVAE [Roberts et al., 2018]

- Comparing Interpolation
 - In the data space (melodies)





– In the latent space





Jean-Pierre Briot





BeatBlender in TensorFlow.js MusicVAE [Roberts et al., 2018]



https://experiments.withgoogle.com/ai/beat-blender/view/

Jean-Pierre Briot

LatentLoops in TensorFlow.js MusicVAE [Roberts et al., 2018]



https://teampieshop.github.io/latent-loops/

Generative Adversarial Networks

Generative Adversarial Networks (GAN) [Goodfellow et al., 2014]



Real Data Base

Generative Adversarial Networks (GAN) [Goodfellow et al., 2014]

- Training Simultaneously 2 Neural Networks
 - Generator
 - Transforms Random noise Vectors into *Faked* Samples
 - Discriminator



- Estimates probability that the Sample came from training data rather than from G
- Minimax 2-player game $\min_{G} \max_{D} V(G,D) = \mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{x} \sim p_{\text{Data}}}[\log D(\mathbf{x})] + \mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{z} \sim p_{\mathbf{z}}(\mathbf{z})}[\log(1 D(G(\mathbf{z})))]$



Examples of GAN Generated Images



Jean-Pierre Briot

Eyeglass

Bangs

Pointy Nose

Oval Face

Deep Learning – Music Generation – 2019 [Karras et al., 2018] 137

MidiNet [Yang et al., 2017]

- Conditioning information
 - Previous measure
 - Chord sequence



- Scope:
 - Previous measure (1D conditions)
 - Various previous measures (2D conditions)
- Fine control:
 - Conditioning on previous measure 1D/2D and on chord sequence 1D/2D for one/all convolutional layers
 - Ex: previous measure 1D and on chord sequence 2D for all convolutional layers
 - » Follows more chord sequence



GAN Examples – Celtic Melodies



GAN Examples – Bach Chorales



Conditional LSTM-GAN [Yu, 2019]



Conditional LSTM-GAN [Yu, 2019]





Jean-Pierre Briot

VAE vs GAN

• VAE (Variational Autoencoder) and GAN (Generative Adversarial Networks)

Some Similarities:

- Are both generative architectures
- Generate from random latent variables

Differences:

- VAE is representational of the whole training dataset
- GAN is not
- VAE Smooth control interface for exploring latent data space
- GAN has some (ex: interpolation) but not as for VAE
- GAN produces better quality content (ex: better resolution images)
 - Not a main issue for symbolic music representation






Open Issues

- Structure
 - Ex: LSTM [Hochreiter & Schmidhuber, 1997]
 - Clockwork RNN [Koutnik et al., 2014]
 - SampleRNN [Mehri et al., 2017]
 - MusicVAE [Roberts et al., 2018]
- Control
 - Tonality Conformance
 - Rhythm
 - Ex: C-RBM [Lattner et al., 2016]
 - Conditioning
 - Arbitrary Constraints
- Creativity Incentive
 - Vs Style Conformance
 - Ex: CAN [Elgammal et al., 2017]
- Interactivity/Incrementality
 - Ex: DeepBach [Hadjeres et al., 2017]
 - Incremental Sampling

Jean-Pierre Briot

Deep Learning – Music Generation – 2019









Style vs/and Control



Style vs/and Originality





Creative Adversarial Networks (CAN) [Elgammal et al., 2017]

- Extension of GAN
- Combining 2 (Contradictory) Objectives:
 - How Discriminator believes that the sample comes from the training dataset (GAN)
 - How Easily the Discriminator can classify the sample into established styles (classes)
 - If there is strong ambiguity (i.e., various classes are equiprobable), this means that the sample is difficult to » fit within the existing art styles
 - Maybe a new style has been created... »



Creative Adversarial Networks (CAN) – Ex. of Paintings Generated

Style name	Image number	Style name	Image number			
Abstract-Expressionism	2782	Mannerism-Late-Renaissance	1279			
Action-Painting	98	Minimalism		the second s	The second and a second second	
Analytical-Cubism	110	Naive Art-Primi		and the second		
Art-Nouveau-Modern	4334	New-Realism				~ ~ ~ ~
Baroque	4241	Northern-Renai		and the second se		
Color-Field-Painting	1615	Pointillism			Allen Martin and	
Contemporary-Realism	481	Pop-Art		and the second se	and the second second	
Cubism	2236	Post-Impression			Contraction of the North Contraction	and the man and a
Early-Renaissance	1391	Realism		and the set of the	A PHIL PORT IN A MARK	THE CONTRACT OF THE A
Expressionism	6736	Rococo		Martine Provident		
Fauvism	934	Romanticism		A DESCRIPTION OF THE PARTY OF T		
High-Renaissance	1343	Synthetic-Cubis		A STATE AND A STATE		Contraction of the second
Impressionism	13060	Total		- LON BRIDE HERE		TO AN IN SPACE OF BUILDING OF MIL

Jean-Pierre Briot

Table 1: Artistic Styles Used in Training

Deep Learning – Music Generation – 2019

Control

- Strategies:
 - Sampling
 - Conditionning (Parametrization)
 - Input Manipulation
 - Reinforcement
 - Unit Selection
 - Bottom up (Low-level adjustment)
 - » Ex: Sampling
 - Top down (Structure imposition)
 - » Ex: Unit and Selection
- Entry points (Hooks)
 - Input
 - Hidden
 - Output
 - Encapsulation/Reformulation



Operational



- May attach Constraints and Functions
 - Ex: Factor Graphs, Markov Constraints [Pachet & Roy, 2011]







Jean-Pierre Briot

Deep Learning – Music Generation – 2019

Constrained Higher-Order Markov



[Roy and Pachet, 2017]

Markov Model vs Deep Learning

+ Markov models are conceptually simple

Markov models simpler

+ Markov models have a simple implementation and a simple learning algorithm as the model is a transition probability table

-- Neural network models are conceptually simple but the optimized implementations of current deep network architecture may be complex and need a lot of tuning

-- Order 1 Markov models (that is, considering only the previous state) do not capture long-term temporal structures

-- Order n Markov models (considering n previous states) are possible but require an explosive training set size and can lead to plaglarism

+ Neural networks can capture various types of relations, contexts and regularities

+ Deep networks can learn long-term and high-order dependencies

+ Markov models can learn from a few examples

Deep learning more conformant

-- Neural networks need a lot of examples in order to be able to learn well

-- Markov models do not generalize very well

+ Neural networks generalize better through the use of distributed representations

+ Markov models are operational models (automata) on which some control on the generation could be attached

-- Deep networks are generative models with a distributed representation and therefore with no direct control to be attached

Configuration and Control Issues

- Corpus (Curation): Training Examples -> Style
- Architecture(s)
 - Single or Compound
 - Conditioning (Parameterization)
 - Configuration (Hyperparameters)
 - Loss Function
 - » From Prediction or Reconstruction Error to Incorporating more and more Constraints
 - External Loss/Control, ex: Adversarial/GAN
- Strategy(ies)
 - Data/Input Manipulation, Ex: Latent Variables
- Improbable Settings Imagination Limits?
- Interactivity

Autonomous Generation vs Creation Support

Autonomous vs Assisted Music Creation

- Autonomous Generation/Interpretation
 - Turing Test
 - Symbolic or/and Audio Music Generation
 - Parametrization/User Preferences (Style, Mood, etc.)
 - For Commercials and Documentaries
 - Create Royalty-free or Copyright-buyable Music





- Assistance to Human Composers and Musicians
 - Propose
 - Refine
 - Analyze
 - Harmonize
 - Produce
 - Ex: FlowComposer [Pachet et al., 2014]



Deep Learning – Music Generation – 2019

- Symbolic or/and Audio Music Generation
- For Commercials and Documentaries
- Create Royalty-free or Copyright-buyable Music
- Based on Deep learning + Samples + Sound processing techniques
- + Business model
- -- Musical model

Bach Chorales Turing Test

- Autonomous Artificial Musicians
- Music Composition Turing test
 - Imitation Game Scenario [Turing, 1950]
 - Designed by A. Turing to explore the question "Can Machines think?"



A. M. Turing (1950) Computing Machinery and Intelligence. Mind 49: 433-460.

COMPUTING MACHINERY AND INTELLIGENCE

By A. M. Turing

1. The Imitation Game

I propose to consider the question, "Can machines think?" This should begin with definitions of the meaning of the terms "machine" and "think." The definitions might be fined so as to reflect so far as possible the normal use of the words, but this attitude is dangerous, If the meaning of the words "machine" and "think" are to be found by examining how they are commonly used it is difficult to escape the conclusion that the meaning and the answer to the question, "Can machines think?" is to be sought in a statistical survey such as a Gallup coll. But this is absurt. Instead of attempting such as definition I shall replace the question by another, which is closely related to it and is expressed in relatively unambiguous words.

The new form of the problem can be described in terms of a game which we call the imitation game." It is played with three people, a man (A), a woman (B), and an interrogator (C) who may be of either sex. The intercogator stays in a room apart front the other two. The object of the game for the intercogator is to determine which of the other two is the man and which is the woman. He knows there by labels X and Y, and at the end of the game he says either "X is A and Y is B" or "X is B and Y is A." The intercogator is lowed to part questions to A and B thus:

C: Will X please tell me the length of his or her hair?

Now suppose X is actually A, then A must answer. It is A's object in the game to try and cause C to make the wrong identification. His answer might therefore be:

"My hair is shingled, and the longest strands are about nine inches long."

In order that tones of voice may not help the interrogator the answers should be written, or better still, typewritten. The ideal arrangement is to have a teleprinter communicating between the two rooms. Alternatively the question and answers can be repeated by an intermediary. The object of the game for the third player (B) is to help the interrogator. The best strategy for her is probably to give truthful answers. She can add such things as "I am the woman, don't listen to him!" to her answers, but it will avail nothing as the man can make similar remarks.

We now ask the question, "What will happen when a machine takes the part of A in this game?" Will the interrogator decide wrongly as often when the game is played like this as he does when the game is played between a man and a woman? These questions replace our original. 'Can machines think?'

- To evaluate artificial composers techniques
- To explore music cognition

Bach Chorales Turing Test

- February 2017, Dutch TV Channel
- Bach vs DeepBach Turing Test



	Current Systems	Future Systems	
	Autonomous Generalization-based	Augmentation/Assistance Creative-incentived	
Objective	Create music	Create music not possible otherwise	
Evaluation	Please the listener	Please the composer	
Risk	Conventional	Surprising But meaningful	

Co-Creativity

Co-Creation by Human(s)+Machine(s)
– Ex: FlowComposer [Pachet et al., 2014]



- Continuator [Pachet, 2002]



- Omax/DYCI2 [Assayag et al., 2003]



Jean-Pierre Briot

FlowComposer [Pachet et al., 2014] – Demo (B. Carré)



Hello World

- January 2018, Hello World, Flow Records
- Making Off



https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=yxTF-UFvoHU

Deep Learning Co-Creation/Assistance & Interactivity

- $Y\Delta CHT/MusicVAE$ [Roberts et al., 2018]
 - Non interactive Generation
 - Loops
 - Collage
- DeepBach [Hadjeres et al., 2017]
 - (Incremental Sampling)
 - Interactive/Selective Regeneration
- MeasureVAE+LatentRNN+MeasureVAE [Pati et al., 2019]
 - Inpainting
 - Previous Measure + Next measure
 - -> Latent Embeddings -> Missing Embedding
 - -> Missing Measure



Inpainted Measures

f If f If f Ifterert

ووو ووود ارد ما ادر داوو ومام الله

2ª rereal by Irr by and





Past Context

Interactivity DeepBach [Hadjeres et al., 2017]



https://www.youtube.com/watch?time_continue=28&v=OkkKjy3WRNo

Interactive Creation Environment

- A Deep Learning-Based Flow Composer Analog ?
- Slower Learning than for Markov Models
 - But GPUs, etc.
 - And Corpus Pre-Training
- No (or not yet) Exact Control Method (Markov Constraints)
- Various Architectures/Strategies
- Inspiration, RNN-based
- Complementation, Feedforward-based
- Control, VAE-based
- Inpairing, (V)AE+RNN-based

← → C □ Isdb.flow-machines	.com/leadsheet.php?id= ciété de productio	570e6d8658e3388506 r les lives du F AGENC	7b23c6&edition=1& ES VOIX OFF G symb	ole piano - Rec III BBC	Playlists - BBC 1	WeTransfer 🔁 La théorie des corde	Q 🏠 😋 /
Database Songs Newsong Copy song	Chords Styles Sources	Songsets Music Files Re	chord Radio About				benot
	File	Notes Suggest Chord	is Structure H	armonic Analysis Harmon	nizer Similarity Ana	ysis Composer	
	American Songwri :	No composer Song	Ha	Note Duration	Chord Changes In	piration from	
	Scriber	Composer	Song -	20 setter short 14 long	many \$6 from an	og 50 mejon	
Toggle background Add to Songset							
			Untitled			Unknown (with FC)	History
4m7	07	Gm7	67	EM7	Gm7	67	Open song - Untitle
	3	Ginz			- 1		Constraint
61		₿ #J ₩J J	1 10 1			20"	Constraint
		Harris Anna A		-	and an interest in		Constraint
							Constraint
Fm7 Bb7	Eb6	De7	Em7				Constraint
		11-	- í	_	· .		
	1						
And the Association of the Association	and the state of the	and the second s	and the second second		Manage Property	and the internet	
With this vi	intane ren	dering I	want to	change	the		
	intage i en	ucring i	want to	change	ure		
			11 at #	120 //		Broot But	
	1900 -	MIDIO MIDIO	See House	Tenno Loon Metro	N R R R R		

- Deep Learning-based Music Generation
- Successes and Limits/Prospects
- Objective Loss Function Hypothesis
- Conformance Pros and Cons
- Control
- Structure
- Explication
- Markov Models (and other Models) still Interesting
- Symbolic AI (GOFAI) still Necessary
- Automated Generation vs Human-Machine Co-Creation
- New Usages

Jean-Pierre Briot

(Some) Other References

- Jordi Pons, Neural Networks For Music: A Journey Through Its History, October 2018, https://towardsdatascience.com/neural-networks-for-musica-journey-through-its-history-91f93c3459fb
- Ian Goodfellow, Yoshua Bengio and Aaron Courville, Deep Learning, MIT Press, 2018
- Andrew Ng, Machine Learning Yearning, Deeplearning.ai
- Tom Mitchell, Machine Learning, McGraw Hill, 2017
- Pedro Domingos, The Master algorithm, Basic Books, 2015
- Judea Pearl and Dana Mackenzie, The Book of Why, Penguin Books, 2018
- Gerhard Nierhaus, Algorithmic Composition: Paradigms of Automated Music Generation, Springer, 2009
- David Cope, The Algorithmic Composer, A-R Editions, 2000
- Roger T. Dean and Alex McLean, The Oxford Handbook of Algorithmic Music, Oxford Handbooks, Oxford University Press, 2018
- Curtis Roads, The Computer Music Tutorial, MIT Press, 1996

Thank You – Questions